# BEFORE THE IDAHO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF	)	
HOKU MATERIALS, INC. FOR	) C.	<b>ASE NO. IPC-E-12-02</b>
REPARATIONS AND REFORMATION OF	)	
ITS AMENDED SPECIAL CONTRACT	) No	OTICE OF PETITION
WITH IDAHO POWER COMPANY	)	
	) No	OTICE OF
	) Pl	ROPOSED SETTLEMENT
	)	
	) 0	RDER NO. 32465

On January 9, 2012, Hoku Materials, Inc. filed a Petition<sup>1</sup> requesting that its "Amended and Restated Agreement for Electric Service" (the "amended special contract") with Idaho Power Company dated June 19, 2009, be reformed. Hoku is a special contract customer of Idaho Power and is constructing a new polysilicon manufacturing facility in Pocatello. Under the amended special contract, Hoku takes service under two rate blocks. The first block rate is equivalent to Idaho Power's avoided cost rates in 2009. The first block is "take-or-pay" and requires Hoku to either "take" power every month or "pay" a monthly minimum amount regardless of consumption. Order No. 32437 at 2. The amended special contract runs from December 1, 2009 through December 1, 2013, and provides that Hoku's peak monthly demand would not exceed 82 MW. Amended Contract at § 6.

## **BACKGROUND**

The history of the special contract between Hoku and Idaho Power is set out in Order No. 32437 but the pertinent facts are set out here. In June 2009, Idaho Power and Hoku amended several terms of their original special contract. Among other terms, the parties agreed to delay the start date of the amended contract and its take-or-pay provision until December 1, 2009. In approving the amended special contract, the Commission observed that it was "mindful of the current economic downturn which precipitated Hoku's decision to seek a delay in the start

NOTICE OF PETITION NOTICE OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT ORDER NO. 32465

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Hoku initially filed its Petition as a "complaint" seeking reformation and reparations under the amended special contract. In Order No. 32437, the Commission noted that this case was more properly considered to be a "petition" rather than a "complaint." Order No. 32437 at n.2. Consequently, on January 17, 2012, Hoku filed a Motion to Correct the Caption of the present proceeding.

date of its [special contract] with Idaho Power." Order No. 32437 at 2 *citing* Order No. 30869 at 4.

In November 2009, the parties subsequently agreed to waive payment of the minimum energy charge (i.e., the minimum take-or-pay provision) until April 1, 2011. In Order No. 31005 issued in February 2010, the Commission approved the temporary waiver of the take-or-pay provision. The Commission acknowledged that the postponement of the minimum take-or-pay provision will "assist Hoku in establishing a 'firm footing amidst the current adverse business climate." Order No. 32437 at 3 *quoting* Order No. 31005 at 5. Since April 1, 2011, Hoku has paid the minimum charge under the take-or-pay provision of the amended special contract.<sup>2</sup>

In December 2011, Hoku filed a formal complaint against Idaho Power requesting that the Commission prohibit the utility from terminating service to Hoku for failure to pay its monthly take-or-pay charges. Case No. IPC-E-11-28. In conjunction with the 11-28 case, Hoku also filed the present Petition requesting that its minimum monthly bills starting in December 2011 be suspended until the Commission issues a final Order regarding Hoku's request to reform its amended special contract. Response at 3. In Order No. 32437 issued January 13, 2012, the Commission declined to suspend Hoku's December 2011 minimum monthly payment due January 19, 2012. Order No. 32437 at 9. Instead, the Commission directed Idaho Power and Hoku

to immediately enter into negotiations regarding Hoku's Petition to reform the amended special contract. . . . Without deciding the issue, we advise the parties that waiver of the first block energy charge beginning with the January 2012 bill should be part of their negotiations. If settlement negotiations are not fruitful, the Commission will issue further instructions regarding the processing of the Petition.

Order No. 32437 at 11.<sup>3</sup>

## THE REFORMATION PETITION

In its Petition, Hoku seeks relief from the minimum take-or-pay provision. More specifically, Hoku requests reformation of Section 5.7 of the amended special contract. As set

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Although the minimum payments are seasonally adjusted, the November 2011 minimum charge was approximately \$1.896 million.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> No person sought reconsideration of Order No. 32437.

out below, this provision provides that Idaho Power may release Hoku from its first block energy commitment. Hoku alleges that Idaho Power has "unreasonably refused" to release Hoku from its first block purchase or payment commitment. Petition at ¶¶ 10.13. Consequently, Hoku requests that the Commission reform Section 5.7 of the contract by adding the underlined text

Release of First Block Energy: With adequate notice and the written consent of Idaho Power <u>or by order of the Commission</u>, Hoku may request a release of all or part of its First Block Energy purchase commitment in return for credit on its First Block Energy Charge. The value of the credit will be determined by mutual agreement <u>or by order of the Commission</u> and will take into consideration the timing of the notice and Idaho Power's ability to manage any supply commitments made on Hoku's behalf.

Petition at ¶ 14. In addition to reformation of the special contract, Hoku also asserts that it is entitled to reparation for its First Block Energy and Demand (i.e., take-or-pay) payments in an amount to be determined by the Commission. Id. at ¶ 15. Finally, while the Commission is processing the Petition, Hoku also seeks suspension of the minimum payments under its take-or-pay provision "until such time as Hoku is prepared to commence the production ramp-up of its polysilicon deposition reactors." Id. at ¶ 16.

Following issuance of the Commission's final Order No. 32437 in the 11-28 case, Hoku, Idaho Power, and Commission Staff (hereinafter "the Parties") met on five occasions in settlement negotiations. The Parties subsequently entered into a "Settlement Stipulation" that would resolve all the disputed issues in Hoku's Petition. On February 17, 2012, the Parties filed a Joint Motion to Approve the Settlement Stipulation and filed testimony in support of the proposed settlement.

#### NOTICE OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT

The Parties agreed to resolve all the disputed issues in Hoku's Petition. As set out in the Stipulation, the Parties agreed to reduce the monthly minimum payments for the first block to \$800,000 for a period not to exceed 18 months from January 1, 2012, through June 30, 2013. Hoku will continue to pay the applicable energy efficiency surcharge (Schedule 91). The amended special contract will be extended for another year (until December 1, 2014), and the

NOTICE OF PETITION NOTICE OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT ORDER NO. 32465 cumulative total of the reduced minimum payments will be added to the end of the contract.<sup>4</sup> Stipulation § 6.4.

Other elements of the proposed Settlement Stipulation include:

- 1. <u>Up-front Payment</u>. In consideration for amending the contract, Hoku shall pay to Idaho Power \$3.8 million as an "up-front payment." Idaho Power will immediately collect \$2 million for the up-front payment from the existing \$4 million deposit held by Idaho Power. The remaining balance will be collected by assessing Hoku an additional monthly payment of \$100,000 for 18 months. Stipulation § 6.3.
- 2. <u>Balancing Mechanism</u>. Effective January 1, 2012, Idaho Power will establish a "balancing mechanism" capped at \$16.5 million and the balancing mechanism will accrue interest at 6%. The purpose of the mechanism is to track the difference between: (1) the deferred first block minimum energy charges under the amended special contract; and (2) the "modified" minimum monthly billed energy charges (excluding demand) under the proposed Settlement Stipulation. Beginning with the invoice for service in December 2013, Idaho Power will then charge and recover from Hoku 1/12 of the balance in the balancing mechanism. In other words, Idaho Power will charge and recover minimum payment amounts that were deferred during the 18-month deferral period over 12 months, in addition to all other energy and demand charges. All payments collected from the balancing mechanism will be allocated to ratepayers in the Company's PCA mechanism. Stipulation § 6.2.
- 3. <u>Usage</u>. If Hoku plans to begin commercial operation during the 18-month deferral period, it must provide a 6-month advance notice before its monthly consumption may exceed 20 MW. *Id.* § 6.5. Once Hoku uses more than 20 MW of energy in any given month, then Hoku shall be obligated to pay the minimum billed energy charge according to the current amended special contract for the remainder of the deferral period. Stipulation § 6.6.

The Parties recommend that the Commission issue a Notice of Proposed Settlement and request comments within 14 days of the Commission's Notice. Stipulation at 10. Each party also filed testimony supporting the approval of the proposed Settlement Stipulation. The Parties assert that the Settlement Stipulation is in the public interest and that all of its terms and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Stipulation also required that Hoku make the first payment under the Settlement Stipulation for services rendered in January 2012 in the amount of \$932,000. Stipulation § 6.1. Idaho Power received the first payment on February 17, 2012.

conditions are fair, just and reasonable. If the Commission approves of the proposed settlement, then the Stipulation provides that the Parties shall submit a "revised" amended special contract within 30 days that "reflect[s] the terms and conditions of this Settlement Stipulation." *Id.* at 8.

#### NOTICE OF COMMENT PERIOD

YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED that the Commission has decided to seek public comment regarding the proposed Settlement Stipulation and modification of the amended special contract between Hoku and Idaho Power. Given the request of the Parties and the press of time, the Commission finds there is good cause to seek comments within 14 days from the date of this Order.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that the Commission has determined that the public interest may not require a formal hearing in this matter and will proceed under Modified Procedure pursuant to Rules 201 through 204 of the Idaho Public Utilities Commission's Rules of Procedure, IDAPA 31.01.01.201 through .204.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that the Settlement Stipulation together with the Parties' supporting testimony can be viewed at the Commission offices during regular business hours. The Petition, Settlement Stipulation, Joint Motion, and supporting testimony are also available for review on the Commission's web site at <a href="www.idaho.puc.gov">www.idaho.puc.gov</a> by clicking on "File Room" and then "Electric Cases."

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that any person desiring to state a position on the proposed Settlement Stipulation may file a written comment in support or opposition with the Commission no later than 14 days from the date of this Order. The comment must contain a statement of reasons supporting the comment period. Written comments concerning this Petition shall be mailed to the Commission and the Parties at the addresses reflected below:

5

Commission Secretary

Idaho Public Utilities Commission

PO Box 83720 Roise ID 83720 007

Boise, ID 83720-0074

Street Address for Express Mail:

472 W. Washington Street Boise, ID 83702-5918

**Idaho Power Company:** 

Jason B. Williams
Lisa D. Nordstrom

Idaho Power Company

PO Box 70

Boise, ID 83707-0070

E-Mail: jwilliams@idahopower.com lnordstrom@idahopower.com

NOTICE OF PETITION NOTICE OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT ORDER NO. 32465 Hoku Materials, Inc.

Dean J. Miller McDevitt & Miller LLP

420 W. Bannock Street PO Box 2564 (83701)

Boise, ID 83702

E-mail: joe@mcdevitt-miller.com

All comments should contain the case caption and case number shown on the first page of this

document. Persons desiring to submit comments via e-mail may do so by accessing the

Commission's home page located at www.puc.idaho.gov. Click the "Comments and Questions"

icon and complete the comment form using the case number as it appears on the front of this

document. These comments must also be sent to the Parties at the e-mail addresses listed above.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that if no written comments or protests are

received within the time limit set, the Commission will consider this matter on its merits and

enter its Order without a formal hearing. If written comments are received within the time limit

set, the Commission will consider them and, in its discretion, may set the same for formal

hearing.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that all proceedings in this case will be held

pursuant to the Commission's jurisdiction under Title 61 of the Idaho Code, and specifically

Idaho Code § 61-503. The Commission may enter any final Order consistent with its authority

under Title 61.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that all proceedings in this matter will be

conducted pursuant to the Commission's Rules of Procedure, IDAPA 31.01.01.000 et seq.

YOU ARE FURTHER NOTIFIED that the Commission is not bound by any

settlement reached by the Parties. The Commission will independently review any proposed

settlement to determine whether the settlement is just, fair and reasonable, and in the public

interest, or otherwise in accordance with law and regulatory policy. The Commission may

accept the settlement, reject the settlement, or state additional conditions under the which the

settlement will be accepted. IDAPA 31.01.01.274-.276.

NOTICE OF PETITION NOTICE OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT

**ORDER NO. 32465** 

6

## ORDER

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that persons wishing to file comments in this matter do so no later than 14 days from the date of this Order.

DONE by Order of the Idaho Public Utilities Commission at Boise, Idaho this 22 day of February 2012.

PAUL KJELLANDER, PRESIDENT

MACK A. REDFORD, COMMISSIONER

MARSHA H. SMITH, COMMISSIONER

ATTEST:

Jean D. Jewell

Commission Secretary

bls/O:IPC-E-12-02\_dh